from the desk of

BRIAN CRAIG

address

300 W 6th St Sheffield, AL 35660

tel 256-383-6052 xt 2508 fax 256-386-5707 email bcraig@scs.k12.al.us July 24, 2012 Brian Craig District Technology Coordinator Sheffield City School District 300 West Sixth Street Sheffield, Alabama 35660-2802

To whom it may concern,

CC Docket No. 02-6

Request for Review

Request for Waiver

The following information is concerning an appeal to the SLD for the purpose of fund restoration from Vendor AT&T for Metro E Bundled Services.

FRN: 2103981 Funding Yr 2011 BEN: 128025 Sheffield City School District

Date of SLD approval June 28, 2011 SPIN: 143004824 BellSouth Telecomm Inc

State of appeal: Alabama Billing Acct. #: 256 M25 5334

Details of Appeal:

USAC/SLD approved FRN 2103981 for \$49,837.95 worth of discounts for Internet Access as part of the Metro E Bundle for Sheffield City School District (128025 BEN). However, AT&T (BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc) stopped discounts at \$23,490.00 due to a clerical error by the District Technology Coordinator (Brian Craig) on the Form 471 application. AT&T states that Brian Craig marked the wrong "Category of Service" on the Form 471 #776192. The "Category of Service" was marked 'Internet Access' when in fact (according to AT&T), it should have been marked as "Telecommunication Services". As the approval was received from the SLD for FRN 2103981, and the Form 486 was completed, a corresponding AT&T GRID form was completed with this 'error' in ignorance. Sheffield City Schools had not been informed of the proper "Category of Service until 2/13/2012. This clerical error has cost Sheffield City Schools in monthly discounts of over \$30,000.00 on this approved FRN 2103981.

I have appealed to the SLD on behalf of Sheffield City School District that the remaining funds due to the school system be released for FRN 2103981 in forgiveness of this clerical error. The proper corrections have been made for the Funding Yr 2012. Now I am appealing to the FCC to please release an approved appeal request to AT&T to release the funding to our school system. All the funding that was approved for the Metro E Bundle for Sheffield was approved under the same account number with AT&T. A simple clerical error has held up the approved total funding.



from the desk of

BRIAN CRAIG

address

300 W 6th St Sheffield, AL 35660

tel 256-383-6052 xt 2508 fax 256-386-5707 email bcraig@scs.k12.al.us Attached to the appeal are copies of the USAC SLD E-Rate Quarterly Disbursements Authorization report, AT&T GRID form, and emails of conversations between AT&T and Sheffield City Schools concerning this issue. Also included is the Administrator's Decision on Appeal letter concerning this issue.

Thank you for your consideration on this important matter.

Sincerely yours,

Brian Craig

Craig, Brian

From: HARRIS, OLIVER M [oh2910@att.com]
Sent: Monday, February 13, 2012 9:33 AM

To: Craig, Brian

Subject: SLD Filings and AT&T discount

Brian,

I appreciate you speaking with me this morning about the situation with the AT&T eRate discounts for your services. I did contact Ms. Stephanie Harris regarding the discounted amounts that have not been applied to the services provided by AT&T. It is my understanding that an error in filing has occurred and needs to be corrected. As it stands now, the amounts that have been disbursed are correct based on the approvals for the FRNs from the SLD.

Please contact the SLD and inquire as to what needs to be done to file an extension of the previous year as well as what needs to be done to get this corrected from a 470/471 filing standpoint. AT&T is ready to provide whatever discount amounts are approved by SLD. Ms, Harris is there to support you and provide whatever documentation is requested by the District or SLD. At this point, SLD would need to provide the okay to AT&T in order for additional discounts to be applied.

Thanks!
Oliver Harris
AT&T Business Solutions
* Phone: 256.922.2739
* Fax: 256.922.2751

This e-mail and any files transmitted with it are AT&T property, are confidential, and are intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom this email is addressed. If you are not one of the named recipient(s) or otherwise have reason to believe that you have received this message in error, please notify the sender and delete this message immediately from your computer. Any other use, retention, dissemination, forwarding, printing, or copying of this e-mail is strictly prohibited.

This message has been scanned for viruses and dangerous content by MailScanner, and is believed to be clean.

Craig, Brian

From: HARRIS, STEPHANIE L [SH2308@att.com]

Sent: Thursday, March 15, 2012 3:37 PM

To: Stanfield, Rettia S.

Cc: Craig, Brian; Morgan, Timothy J.; BENAVIDES, JENNIFER R

Subject: RE: AT&T ERATE?

Hello Rettia,

I have not declined E-Rate discounts. As stated previously I have implemented grids for FRN (s) 1939455 and 1939563 based on information you submitted. Although the Internet FRN had a balance of \$23,737.95, there were no additional Billing Account Numbers with Internet services to discount. My recommendation is to work directly with SLD to correct the 471 error because they have the authority to correct funding issues.

If further assistance is needed, please feel free to email or give me a call.

Thanks.

Stephanie Harris

Sr. Contract / Sourcing Specialist National E-Rate Center of Excellence AT&T Business Solutions - SE Telco (404) 829-6489 Phone (404) 829-6316 Fax sh2308@att.com

This e-mail and any files transmitted with it are the property of AT&T, are confidential, and are intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom this e-mail is addressed. If you are not one of the named recipients or otherwise have reason to believe that you have received this message in error, please notify the sender at (404) 829-6489 and delete this message immediately from your computer. Any other use, retention, dissemination, forwarding, printing, or copying of this e-mail is strictly prohibited.

From: Stanfield, Rettia S. [mailto:RSStanfield@scs.k12.al.us]

Sent: Wednesday, March 14, 2012 10:29 AM

To: HARRIS, STEPHANIE L

Cc: Craig, Brian; Morgan, Timothy J.

Subject: AT&T ERATE?

Hi Stephanie,

I just left another voice message on your company phone.

I know that you are very busy, and I apologize for creating more work for you because of an error on our part but we cannot go any further until we get the required documents.

I would greatly appreciate your help in getting this problem resolved.

Please call or email me.

Thanks, Rettia From: Stanfield, Rettia S.

Sent: Tuesday, March 13, 2012 8:52 AM

To: HARRIS, STEPHANIE L

Cc: Craig, Brian; Morgan, Timothy J.

Subject: need reason discount was declined

Hi Stephanie,

If you will please read the message at the bottom of this page, it will hopefully remind you of the problem Sheffield had last year. Brian Craig was not able to get this corrected AND we now have the same problem in FY 11-12. Brian has spoken with ERATE contacts (federal and state), and they are telling him if he can a get written explanation for AT&T declining the discounts, they will be able help him correct the problem. We lost \$30,000 in discounts for FY 10-11 and are in the process of doing the same this year. Obviously this is money that I did not budget and we can afford to lose.

Would you please look at the accounts listed below and provide us with written documentation for denial of payment from USAC (or AT&T) so that Brian can correct this problem?

The two erate form 471 for the Erate year of 11-12 are:

776730 and 776192

The two erate form 471 for the Erate year of 10-11 are:

710627 and 710209

If you need more information, please call or email me. Thanks for your help, Rettia

Rettia Stanfield CSFO, Sheffield City Schools 300 West Sixth Street Sheffield, AL 35660 (256)383-0400 ext 207

From: Craig, Brian

Sent: Tuesday, March 13, 2012 8:22 AM

To: Stanfield, Rettia S.

Subject: AT&T ERate for Metro E

Stephanie Harris 404-829-6489 sh2308@att.com
The two erate form 471 for the Erate year of 11-12 are:
776730 and 776192
The two erate form 471 for the Erate year of 10-11 are:
710627 and 710209

I have corrected the Form 471's for this coming year.

Brian Craig District Technology Coordinator Sheffield City Schools <u>bcraig@scs.k12.al.us</u> 256-349-0708 Hi Rettia,

The Telecommunications FRN 1939455 has received all available funding committed by SLD (\$23,490.00) for the period of July 2010 – January 2011. The Internet FRN 1939563 has received all due credits for the funding year totaling \$26,100.00 for the entire funding period of July 2010 – June 2011. There is however a balance amount of \$23,737.95 on the Internet FRN 1939563, but I am not aware of how Sheffield was set-up initially with SLD, therefore I don't have the authority to take money from one FRN and use it for another Billing Account Number assigned to a different FRN. Once an internal inquiry has been done regarding this matter please notify me and provide the proper documentation to receive if applicable, any additional E-Rate credits.

Please feel free to email or give me a call if further assistance is needed.

Thanks,

Stephanie Harris

Sr. Contract / Sourcing Specialist National E-Rate Center of Excellence AT&T Business Solutions - SE Telco (404) 829-6489 Phone (404) 829-6310 Fax sh2308@att.com

--

This message has been scanned for viruses and dangerous content by <u>MailScanner</u>, and is believed to be clean.

Craig, Brian

From: Sent: HARRIS, OLIVER M [oh2910@att.com] Wednesday, April 18, 2012 3:05 PM Stanfield, Rettia S.; Craig, Brian

To: Subject:

RE: 256 M25-5334

Ms. Stanfield,

I have e-mailed Ms. Harris regarding this and I am awaiting a reply.

Thanks! Oliver

From: Stanfield, Rettia S. [mailto:RSStanfield@scs.k12.al.us]

Sent: Wednesday, April 18, 2012 1:42 PM **To:** Craig, Brian; HARRIS, OLIVER M

Subject: RE: 256 M25-5334

There are two parts (2 types of services) on this account.

Account number 256 M25-5334 includes charges for:

Host Metro E - 5 lines at \$1,033.50 each for a total charge of \$5,167.50 per month *****AND******

Internet charges Service ID: 6177433117, 617743118, 617743120, 617743122, and 617743124
\$500 each for a total of \$2,500 per month.

The problem with last year's was that the application has a place to designate type of service. The annual cost of Metro-E was been designated as Internet, and the annual cost of Internet was been designated as Metro-E.

Because of the clerical error,

- 1. the lesser funding for internet is used for the larger metro-e bill leaving a large portion of the metro-e to be paid by the Board
- 2. The larger funding amount for e-metro is applied to the smaller internet bill leaving about \$30,000 worth approved discounts unspent because there is not enough internet costs to apply it to.

I am not sure that we have the same problem this year but it LOOKS the same to me on the billing that I receive from AT&T. I do not have the applications so I cannot verify my theory. Please check the service types designated on this application.

Below is a message from Stephanie Harris dated 03/15/2012. I think she is explaining the same thing I have just described.

Thanks, Rettia

From: HARRIS, STEPHANIE L [SH2308@att.com]

Hello Rettia,

I have not declined E-Rate discounts. As stated previously I have implemented grids for FRN (s) 1939455 and 1939563 based on information you submitted. Although the Internet FRN had a balance of \$23,737.95, there were no additional Billing Account Numbers with Internet services to discount. My recommendation is to work directly with SLD to correct the 471 error because they have the authority to correct funding issues.

If further assistance is needed, please feel free to email or give me a call.

Thanks.

Stephanie Harris

Sr. Contract / Sourcing Specialist National E-Rate Center of Excellence AT&T Business Solutions - SE Telco (404) 829-6489 Phone (404) 829-6316 Fax sh2308@att.com

----Original Message----

From: Craig, Brian

Sent: Wednesday, April 18, 2012 1:07 PM

To: HARRIS, OLIVER M Cc: Stanfield, Rettia S. Subject: RE: 256 M25-5334

Well it has never been shared with us that I can tell. Could you please help with this? We are short almost \$60,000 because of this mystery number.

Brian Craig
District Technology Coordinator
Sheffield City Schools
bcraig@scs.k12.al.us
256-349-0708

----Original Message-----

From: HARRIS, OLIVER M [mailto:oh2910@att.com]

Sent: Wednesday, April 18, 2012 1:01 PM

To: Craig, Brian Subject: 256 M25-5334

Brian,

I took a look at the account M25-5334 and this is only for the Metro Ethernet Service (5 circuits). There should be another account that has the Managed Router Service associated with it.

Thanks!
Oliver Harris
AT&T Business Solutions
* Phone: 256.922.2739

* Fax: 256.922.2751

This e-mail and any files transmitted with it are AT&T property, are confidential, and are intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom this email is addressed. If you are not one of the named recipient(s) or otherwise have reason to believe that you have received this message in error, please notify the sender and delete this message immediately from your computer. Any other use, retention, dissemination, forwarding, printing, or copying of this e-mail is strictly prohibited.

- -

This message has been scanned for viruses and dangerous content by MailScanner, and is believed to be clean.

--

This message has been scanned for viruses and dangerous content by <u>MailScanner</u>, and is believed to be clean.

BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. Page									
SPIN #: 143004824 Funding Year: 2011									
	u TIDLE CUM			TOTO ON ONE ODIE					
MU	LIPLE FUN		ST NUMBER MAY BE ENT A: General Information	ERED ON ONE GRIL)				
1. Name of Applicant:	S100 1		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·						
2. Commitment Amount:	Sheffield City School District								
		\$49,837.95' Pre Discount amount \$57,285.00							
3. Applicant Contact Name:	BRIAN (BRIAN CRAIG							
4. Contact # :	256 38	254 383 6052 ext. 2508							
5. Email Address:	bcraig 6	beraig @ ses. Kiz.al.us							
6. Address: provide street address, city, state and zip		Street Address: 300 W. 6th 5t. City: Sheffield Zip: 3566							
address, city, state and zip	Street Address		ervices Ordered Informati		Zip. 33640				
must be in accordance with yo service and location is qualified percentage is not the same as or visit the SLD website at http	ur Form 471 app d to receive disc the FRN discoun ://www.sl.univer	lication, Block 5, ounts under the p it eligibility perce salservice.org	bers (BTN) and FRN's for which y Item 21 attachment for the reference program rules. **If left blank it is intage on your FCDL by the SLD. The Number please input additional	nced FRN. Enter the Perce assumed eligibility is 100% For more information call	ntage for which the line or 6 Caution! This the SLD at (888) 203-8100				
services ordered Information-		 ,		·	·				
1. Billed Telephone Number	2. FRN	3. Percent at which product and/or location is Eligible	4. Type of Service	Telecommunication (T) Internet Access (IA) Internal Connections (IC)	6. Per your item 21- please input Y for YES if this FRN is approved for both Internet & Telecommunication Service				
A	Input	input	Input	input	input if applicable				
123 256 M25 - 5334	1234567 21ø3981	100%	(i.e. Local Service, ES1, Metro E) Internet Access Metro E	T or IA or IC or BMIC	Y Y				
Legrify that the information	provided above	properly reflects	the request and subsequently a	proved funding as design	ated on the Form(s) 471				
Block 5(s) and accompanying It acknowledge that we are resp this document for the current	tem 21 attachme onsible for cont funding year th oply discounts to	ents submitted to acting BellSouth at are eligible and	the Schools and Libraries Division Telecommunications, Inc. to notic d for which discounts should be g Account numbers using the ass	n by the above reference I fy them of any services in applied. By signing below	Billed Entity. I further stalled after the return of I authorize BellSouth				
Preparer's Name:	BRIAN	CRAIG							
Authorized Signature:	HAT.			,					
Date:	7/7/11								
***Once completed & signed, please fax this form to the National E-rate Center of Excellence									

Block B: Services Ordered Information- Additional Billing Telephone Numbers (continued from page 1)

SPIN: 143004824

Action Required: Please list all Billing Telephone Account Numbers (BTN) and FRN's for which you are seeking Discounts. The accounts entered must be in accordance with your Form 471 application, Block 5, Item 21 attachment for the referenced FRN. Enter the Percentage for which the line or service and location is qualified to receive discounts under the program rules. **If left blank it is assumed eligibility is 100%---- Caution! This percentage is not the same as the FRN discount eligibility percentage on your FCDL by the SLD. For more information call the SLD at (888) 203-8100 or visit the SLD website at http://www.sl.universalservice.org

at 1-847-326-3486****

Page 2 of 3

USAC Schools and Libraries E-Rate Quarterly Disbursements Authorization Report

Rate Quarterly Disbursements Period: 01/01/2012 - 03/31/2012

Billed Entity Number: 128025

Billed Entity Name: SHEFFIELD CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT

Funding Year	APPL #	FRN #	FRN Committed Amount	FRN Authorized Disbursements To Date	Service Provider Number (SPIN)	Service Provider Name	Disbursement Authorization Date	Authorized Disbursements		
								SPI	BEAR	Total
07/01/2011-06/30/2012	775107	2101917	\$4,107.51	\$3,059.75	143004824	BellSouth Telecommu	unica 01/12/2012 02/20/2012 03/15/2012	\$386.17 \$385.14 \$386.61		\$386.17 \$385.14 \$386.61
							SPIN Total	\$1,157.92		\$1,157.92
						Ap	plication Total	\$1,157.92		\$1,157.92
07/01/2011-06/30/2012	776192	2103981	\$49,837.95	\$17,400.00	143004824	BellSouth Telecommu	nica 01/12/2012	\$2,175.00		\$2,175.00
			. ,	, ,			02/20/2012	\$2,175.00		\$2,175.00
							03/15/2012	\$2,175.00		\$2,175.00
							SPIN Total	\$6,525.00		\$6,525.00
						Ap	plication Total	\$6,525.00		\$6,525.00
07/01/2011-06/30/2012	776730	2105054	\$23,490.00	\$23,490.00	143004824	BellSouth Telecommu	nica 01/12/2012	\$1,011.36		\$1,011.36
					SPIN Total	\$1,011.36		\$1,011.36		
						Ap	plication Total	\$1,011.36		\$1,011.36
						Total Fund Ye	ar Applications	\$8,694.28		\$8,694.28
						Total Applications	All Fund Years	\$8,694.28		\$8,694.28

Disbursement Authorization Date: Date SLD authorized disbursement unit to disburse funds. SPI: Service Provider Invoice; payments authorized based on this form.

BEAR: Billed Entity Applicant Reimbursement Form; payments authorized based on this form.

USAC Schools and Libraries E-Rate Quarterly Disbursements Authorization Report _____

Period: 10/01/2011 - 12/31/2011

Billed Entity Number: 128025 Billed Entity Name: SHEFFIELD CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT

Funding Year	APPL #	FRN #	FRN Committed Amount	FRN Authorized Disbursements To Date	Service Provider Number (SPIN)	Service Provider Name	Disbursement Authorization Date	Authorized Disbursements		
								SPI	BEAR	Total
07/01/2011-06/30/2012	773778	2099509	\$3,132.00	\$3,132.00	143027426	SCHOOLinSITES.com LLC	10/13/2011	\$3,132.00		\$3,132.00
							SPIN Total	\$3,132.00		\$3,132.00
						Appli	cation Total	\$3,132.00		\$3,132.00
07/01/2011-06/30/2012	775107	2101917	\$4,107.51	\$1,901.83	143004824	BellSouth Telecommunic		\$1,129.70		\$1,129.70
							11/17/2011	\$388.73		\$388.73
							12/15/2011	\$383.40		\$383.40
							SPIN Total	\$1,901.83		\$1,901.83
						Appli	cation Total	\$1,901.83		\$1,901.83
07/01/2011-06/30/2012	776192(2103981) \$49,837.95	\$10,875.00	143004824	BellSouth Telecommunic	a 11/07/2011	\$6,525.00		\$6,525.00
	`						11/17/2011	\$2,175.00		\$2,175.00
							12/15/2011	\$2,175.00		\$2,175.00
							SPIN Total	\$10,875.00		\$10,875.00
						Appli	cation Total	\$10,875.00		\$10,875.00
07/01/2011-06/30/2012	776730	2105054	\$23,490.00	\$22,478.64	143004824	BellSouth Telecommunic	a 11/07/2011	\$4,495.73		\$4,495.73
							11/14/2011	\$8,991.45		\$8,991.45
							11/17/2011	\$4,495.73		\$4,495.73
							12/15/2011	\$4,495.73		\$4,495.73
							SPIN Total	\$22,478.64		\$22,478.64
						Appli	cation Total	\$22,478.64		\$22,478.64
						Total Fund Year	Applications	\$38,387.47		\$38,387.47
						Total Applications Al	l Fund Years	\$38,387.47		\$38,387.47

Disbursement Authorization Date: Date SLD authorized disbursement unit to disburse funds. SPI: Service Provider Invoice; payments authorized based on this form.